2.12 The Eucharist Debate: Transubstantiation and Memorialism Compared: 30-minute Pack

AQA 8062 · about 30 minutes

Total Marks

Name: _____ Date: ____ / ____ / _____

Answer ALL questions.

1 Explain two effects that belief in transubstantiation has on how Mass is celebrated in Roman Catholic practice, focusing on doctrinal consequences rather than service descriptions.

(Total for Question 1 is 4 marks)

2 Explain the importance of the Eucharist debate for Christian unity and identity, considering doctrinal and practical effects across denominations.

(Total for Question 2 is 6 marks)

© Revision Library | revisionlibrary.co.uk

3 Evaluate the view that the doctrine of transubstantiation is the most convincing explanation of what happens at Communion. Give arguments for and against, refer to Christian arguments and reach a conclusion.

(Total for Question 3 is 12 marks)

4 Evaluate the view that a memorialist interpretation of Communion best fulfils Jesus's command to 'do this in remembrance of me'. Give arguments for and against, refer to Christian arguments and reach a conclusion.

(Total for Question 4 is 12 marks)

© Revision Library | revisionlibrary.co.uk

Mark scheme · 2.12 The Eucharist Debate: Transubstantiation and Memorialism Compared: 30-minute Pack

Question 1

point 1: strong reverence and ritual towards the consecrated elements, because they are believed to be Christ's real presence, oe	**B1**
development: this leads to practices such as reservation of the consecrated host and careful handling and distribution, oe	**B1**
point 2: strict rules about who may receive Communion, reflecting belief that Communion is reception of Christ and requires proper spiritual readiness, oe	**B1**
development: this can lead to confession and preparation before receiving, and to closed Communion with non-Catholics in some contexts, oe	**B1**

Answer: E.g. heightened reverence and reservation of the consecrated host; stricter rules on reception and preparation for communicants, both arising from belief in real presence.

Question 2

Level 3 A well-structured answer that explains several ways the Eucharist debate affects unity and identity, with clear evidence and developed reasoning showing impact across denominations.	**5-6**
Level 2 An answer that explains some relevant effects on unity and identity, with reasonable supporting detail but limited development.	**3-4**
Level 1 A simple answer that makes one or two basic points about the debate's importance, with little development.	**1-2**
Level 0 No relevant content.	**0**

Indicative content:

- Doctrinal difference over the presence of Christ can create clear theological boundaries between traditions, shaping denominational identity.
- Practical consequences such as closed Communion or differing frequency of celebration reinforce separate identities and worship patterns.
- Disagreement can hinder full visible unity but also provide a focus for ecumenical dialogue where churches work to understand each other's theology.
- For individual believers the debate can affect belonging, for example whether they feel welcome at another church's Communion service.
- Some reconciliatory approaches, such as recognizing different valid understandings while sharing other forms of fellowship, show the debate is important but not always decisive for cooperation.

Question 3

Level 1 A limited response offering basic, undeveloped points for or against transubstantiation with little reference to Christian theology.	**1-3**
Level 2 A response that gives some developed reasons for and against the view, with reference to Christian teaching, but with limited analysis or balance.	**4-6**
Level 3 A clear, balanced response that develops arguments for and against transubstantiation, refers to Christian sources and shows awareness of counterarguments.	**7-9**
Level 4 A thorough, well-reasoned evaluation that considers theological, scriptural and practical arguments on both sides, engages with counterarguments and reaches a justified, supported conclusion.	**10-12**

Indicative content:

- Arguments for transubstantiation: literal reading of Jesus's words at the Last Supper, the continuity of historic Church teaching, and the theological coherence of sacraments as means of grace.
- Arguments against transubstantiation: memorialist emphasis on remembering Jesus based on 1 Corinthians 11, the challenge of an undetectable metaphysical change, and the Protestant stress on faith rather than ritual change.
- Christian arguments in the middle: Lutheran or Reformed 'real presence' views that affirm Christ is truly present without claiming a change of substance, offering a compromise position.
- Practical considerations: transubstantiation explains reverence and pastoral practice around Communion but may create barriers to ecumenical sharing; memorialism supports frequent, open Communion but may seem to deny Christ's presence to Catholics.
- A supported conclusion will weigh scriptural interpretation, the role of Church authority, and pastoral effects, and may argue which explanation is more convincing for particular theological priorities.

© Revision Library | revisionlibrary.co.uk

Question 4

Level 1 A limited response offering basic assertions about memorialism with little development or theological reference.	**1-3**
Level 2 A response that gives some reasons supporting and opposing memorialism, with some reference to scripture or tradition.	**4-6**
Level 3 A balanced response that develops points for and against memorialism, including Christian theological arguments and implications for worship.	**7-9**
Level 4 A thorough evaluation that weighs scriptural, theological and practical evidence, addresses counterarguments, and reaches a clear, justified conclusion.	**10-12**

Indicative content:

- Arguments for memorialism: it directly follows Jesus's command to remember as recorded in 1 Corinthians 11:24-25 and Luke 22:19, and it highlights the ethical memory of Christ's sacrifice.
- Arguments against memorialism: it may be criticised for reducing the sacrament to symbolism and for not accounting for other biblical texts, such as John 6, which some read as implying a deeper presence.
- Christian alternatives: Catholic transubstantiation and Lutheran or Reformed real-presence positions argue that remembrance does not exclude a true presence of Christ, offering different theological explanations.
- Practical implications: memorialism supports frequent, inclusive celebrations focusing on community and remembrance, but critics argue this approach may lack the theological depth some believers seek.
- A well-reasoned conclusion will consider which theological priorities are most persuasive, such as scriptural literalism, the authority of tradition, or pastoral outcomes in congregational life.

© Revision Library | revisionlibrary.co.uk